# REPUBLIC OF KENYA IN THE SUPREME COURT OF KENYA AT NAIROBI PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION PETITION NO. E005 OF 2022

#### **BETWEEN**

RAILA ODINGA	1 <sup>ST</sup> PETITIONER
MARTHA WANGARI KARUA	2 <sup>ND</sup> PETITIONER
AND	
INDEPENDENT ELECTORAL &	
BOUNDARIES COMMISSION	1 <sup>ST</sup> RESPONDENT
WANYONYI WAFULA CHEBUKATI	2 <sup>ND</sup> RESPONDENT \ 0
BOYA MOLU	
PROF. ABDI YAKUB GULIYE	4 <sup>TH</sup> RESPONDENT
JULIANA WHONGE CHERERA	5 <sup>TH</sup> RESPONDENT
JUSTUS NYANG'AYA	6 <sup>TH</sup> RESPONDENT
FRANCIS WANDERI	7 <sup>TH</sup> RESPONDENT
IRENE MASIT	
WILLIAM SAMOFIRUTO	
MILLIANI SAMICIFI KULUU	

### AFFIDAVIT OF PROF. ABDI YAKUB GULIYE

(In support of the 1st and 2nd Respondents' Case)

-20

- I, **PROF. ABDI YAKUB GULIYE**, a resident of Nairobi County within the Republic of Kenya and of P.O. Box 45371-00100 Nairobi, do hereby make oath and solemnly state as follows:
- THAT I am one of the Commissioners of the Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission (the "1st Respondent" or "Commission"). I was appointed vide gazette Notice No. 400 dated 18th January, 2017 and sworn into office on 20th January, 2017.
- 2. <u>THAT</u> I am conversant with the matters depond to herein hence competent to swear this affidavit.
- 3. THAT I am long serving public officer having served as a lecturer in a public—30 university for close to 30 years. In the course of my career I have also served in managerial roles and Boards of various institutions.

- 4. <u>THAT</u> while I note that the Petitioners have named me as the 4<sup>th</sup> Respondent in this Petition, I verily believe that I have been wrongly joined in the matter for the reasons that:
  - a) the issues raised in the Petition relate to events, acts or omissions which purportedly arose while I was executing my official duties as a Commissioner of the 1st Respondent;
  - b) the Petitioner's case as pleaded does not disclose any cause of action whatsoever against me in my personal capacity;
  - c) even if the Petitioners were to raise any grievances against me, I verily believe that a Presidential Election Petition under Article 140 of the \ \text{O} \ Constitution is not the appropriate forum and form for seeking redress; and
  - d) the decision by the Petitioners to join Commissioners of the 1<sup>st</sup> Respondent as substantive Respondents in the matter is diversionary and a manifest abuse of the Court process which should not be countenanced.
- 5. <u>THAT</u> I swear this affidavit in support of the responses by the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Respondents.
- 6. THAT I have read and understood, and where necessary had explained to me, the Petition dated 21st August, 2022 and filed in court on 22nd August, 2022 together with the Supporting Affidavits sworn by Raila Odinga, Martha Wangari Karua, Saitabao Kanchory, John Mark Githongo, Arnold Ochieng Oginga, Dr. Edgar Ouko—20 Otumba, Bernard Adongo, Dr. Nyangasi Oduwo, Cellestine Anyango Opiyo, Susan Wambugu, Benson Wesonga, Ezra Sunguti, Benjamin Agina, Nathan Githinji Mwangi, Prof. Walter Richard Mebane, Arnold Kakenyi Lenny Muteti and Martin E. Papa as well as the annexures thereto (together "the Petition"). I oppose the Petition.
- 7. THAT I have read the Affidavit of Wafula Wanyonyi Chebukati, the Chairperson of the 1<sup>st</sup> Respondent, filed in response to the Petition and I reiterate and adopt its contents. I further reiterate and adopt the contents of the Answers to the Petition presented on behalf of the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Respondent and lodged in Court pursuant to Rule 11 of the Supreme Court (Presidential Election Petition) Rules, 2017. I wish to 30 state as follows in addition to the responses outlined in the said Answers to the Petition:

- 8. THAT as a Commissioner with the 1st Respondent, I was designated to chair the Commission's Committee that oversees elections operations, which is responsible for, among others, synthesizing all operational issues relating to any upcoming elections and making recommendations to the full Commission for consideration and approval if merited.
- 9. THAT in addition to the foregoing, and in relation to the general elections held on 9th August, 2022, I was nominated to be in charge of the presidential elections tallying centre, a responsibility which was confirmed by the Chairman in writing. (Attached and marked "AYG-1" is a copy of the letter addressed to me by the Chairman in that respect).
- 10. <u>THAT</u> for brevity, I adopt the contents of the affidavit of Wafula Wanyonyi Chebukati fully in relation to the following headings of his Affidavit, namely:
  - a) Pre-poll preparations and issues arising.
  - b) The election day.
  - c) Transmission of results.
  - d) Procedures at the National Tallying Centre.
  - e) Declaration of results.
  - f) Responses to allegations arising from the declared results.
  - g) Responses to cross-cutting allegations contained in various Affidavits.
- 11. THAT I reaffirm the contents of the Part 4 of the affidavit of the Chairman titled 20 "Procedures at the National Tallying Centre" and in particular the portion relating to the concerted but unsuccessful attempts by the named actors to subvert the will of the people, to which I wish to make the following further depositions:
- 12. <u>THAT</u> as a Commissioner and a State Officer I understood my role which required diligent service and fidelity to the Constitution. It was at all times my desire to oversee the conduct of a free fair and credible elections which met the threshold of the Constitution and the law.
- 13. <u>THAT</u> it is my earnest belief that the Commission conducted a free and fair election and that the Commission lived up to the expectation in Article 81 (e) which requires it to remain independent and that the election was conducted in the most 30 transparent, impartial, neutral, efficient, accurate and accountable manner.

- 14. THAT regrettably, while the election was conducted in a free and fair manner, it has been held at a heavy cost to the Commission's staff and service providers who have had to endure incessant harassment, intimidation, abductions, threats to life and even loss of life in the course of duty. I verily believe that in a democracy, the sovereign will of the people should always prevail and that the Commission's role is limited to conducting a legally compliant electoral process and declare the choice of the people.
- 15. THAT while the Commission was still tallying and verifying the presidential election results, I was shocked to learn that some people were willing to sabotage the will of the people and had the audacity to request the Commission to come to their aid to achieve such reprehensible desires. I set out here below those incidences:
- 16. THAT I was informed by the Chairperson that on 13th August, 2022, while the verification process was ongoing, Hon. Raphael Tuju and Governor Charity Ngilu sought audience with him to protest about the fast-tracking of the verification process as agreed with agents of the presidential candidates. It is unclear why a faster conclusion of the process seemed to bother them.
- 17. THAT at about 3am on the morning of 15th August, 2022, the Chaiperson was visited by Hon. Raphael Tuju, Senator Amos Wako and Advocate Kyalo Mbobu. The Chairperson called all the Commissioners to join him to engage the visitors. When all the Commissioners arrived, the meeting was commenced by the Chairperson by inviting the visitors to state their issue. Senator Wako indicated that they had come to ask the Commission not to operate 'in a vacuum' and that it must consider the link between the election results to be declared and stability of the country which he described as "the bigger picture". Senator Wako proceeded to indicate that in his term as Attorney General he also served as the election supervisor and in that capacity he would moderate results guided by the need to achieve law and stability in the country.
- 18. THAT Hon. Raphael Tuju spoke after Senator Wako. He indicated that it was necessary for the results to be 'moderated in favour of baba' and that any contrary declaration of results would 'plunge the country into chaos'. As an alternative, he suggested that in the event that it was not possible to declare 'baba' as the President-Elect, then the Commission should force a run-off. He indicated that should his request be granted, it would be adequately rewarded.

- 19. <u>THAT</u> having heard the sentiments of Hon. Tuju and Senator Wako, the Chairperson invited the Commissioners to comment. Commissioners Juliana Cherera, Justus Nyang'aya, Irene Masit and Francis Wanderi agreed with the remarks of both Senator Wako and Hon. Tuju.
- 20. THAT I informed the meeting that I did not know the outcome of the elections at that point and that any such discussion was unwelcome. Commissioner Molu similarly refused to entertain the discussion, a view that was also shared by the CEO.
- 21. THAT the Chairman took the view that he would respect the will of the people and announce the results as per the final tally from all the polling stations. As regards —\O the proposed incentive, we were all categorical that we would not entertain such requests.
- 22. THAT later the same morning, the Deputy Inspector General of Police, Mr. Noor Gabow came to the holding room who informed me that a team from the National Security Advisory Committee ("NSAC") had arrived at the national tallying centre and wanted to meet the Chairperson. I notified the Chairperson who, at the time, was busy with his duties and indicated that he would convene a briefing meeting with the Commissioners at 2 pm regarding the final results and to listen to the visiting team.
- 23. THAT shortly after 2pm, the meeting with the NSAC delegation commenced with 20 a round of introductions. The delegation was led by Mr. Kennedy Kihara (Principal Administrative Secretary at the Office of the President). The other participants were Mr. Kennedy Ogeto (Solicitor General); Mr. Hillary Mutyambai (Inspector General of Police); and Lieutenant General Francis Omondi Ogolla (Vice Chief of Defence Forces).
- 24. THAT after introductions, Mr. Kennedy Kihara indicated that the team was visiting on behalf of the entire NSAC and that the composition of the members in attendance had been deliberately chosen considering the magnitude of the message to be passed to us.
- 25. THAT after drawing our attention to their level and rank, Mr. Kennedy Kihara —30 proceeded to relay the message. The message was that if the Commission declared Hon. William Samoei Ruto as the President-Elect, 'the country is going to burn' (sic). He proceeded to indicate that skirmishes between the Kikuyu and Luo communities

- had already started 'in several slums including Kibera and Mathare' on the basis of alleged 'betrayal by the Kikuyus'.
- 26. THAT Mr. Kihara proceeded to caution that if we proceeded with declaration of the results with Hon. Ruto as the President-Elect and chaos erupts, 'then the blood of the dead Kenyans' will be on our hands, and that the seven of us (Commissioners) will be held responsible.
- 27. THAT the second part of the message from the NSAC delegation was that if we cannot announce Hon. Raila Amolo Odinga as the outright winner, then we must ensure that there is a run-off.
- 28. <u>THAT</u> only Mr. Kennedy Kihara spoke at the meeting and as he concluded his —\O remarks, he indicated that they wanted from us a message that they could take back to the National Security Advisory Committee.
- 29. THAT after Mr. Kihara concluded his remarks, the Chairperson invited us to share their views. Commissioners Nyang'aya, Masit, Wanderi and Vice Chairperson Cherera were first to comment and said that the message warrants serious consideration and that they supported adoption of the communication by the NSAC 'before taking a decision as to the results to be announced'.
- 30. <u>THAT</u> after the remarks of the first four Commissioners, I spoke. I stated that the Commission has a Constitutional mandate to fulfill and that in declaring the results it will be guided by the same Constitution and applicable law.
- 31. <u>THAT</u> the Chairperson indicated that we had all an oath of office which required fidelity to the Constitution. The NSAC delegation left shortly after, at about 3pm.
- 32. THAT after the NSAC team had left, the Commission Secretary/Chief Executive Officer Mr. Marjan Hussein Marjan walked into the boardroom with the final results and handed over a copy of the results to each Commissioner. A debate ensued. Four Commissioners (Vice Chair Juliana Cherera and Commissioners Justus Nyang'aya, Irene Masit and Francis Wanderi) protested and insisted that the results should be changed in the light of the NSAC delegation's communication.
- 33. THAT Commissioners Masit and Wanderi were of the view that the results should be pushed towards a re-run, which in their view would be a 'win-win' situation to which I exclaimed "how?". Vice Chair Cherera suggested that the margin is not too

big and could be manipulated by moving 233,211 votes from Hon. Ruto to the rejected ballots category. When my turn to speak came I told the Commissioners that I would not be a party to a scheme to sabotage the will of the people.

- 34. THAT having heard the views of all the Commissioners, the Chairman indicated that he would not discuss subversion of the will of the people, and that he would announce and declare the final results in accordance with the verified tallies.
- 35. <u>THAT</u> we walked out of the meeting room and headed towards the auditorium where I was to announce the results of the remaining 27 constituencies before the Chairman could make the final declaration. The results of those constituencies had already been verified in the presence of agents of the candidates and included in the \ \O final tally in Form 34C.
- 36. THAT before I could read the results from the remaining Constituencies, some fracas ensued. In the circumstances, I would not be able to announce the results of the remaining 27 results and neither would the Chairman be able to declare the final results. We went back to the holding room. I was injured in the melee. When calm was restored, the Chairman declared the final results in the midst of chaos and consequently could not go through all the County summations but nonetheless indicated the availability of the forms. Annexed hereto and marked AYG-2 are copies of the Incident Report under OB No. 29/15/08/2022 together with my statement as recorded by the police for further investigations.
- 37. THAT I verily believe that the aggressors at Bomas should be apprehended and charged for many crimes under the Election Offences Act, the Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission Act, the Penal Code amongst others.
- 38. THAT I verily believe that the Honourable Court has power to direct that an order be transmitted to the Director of Public Prosecutions to direct an investigation to be carried out by any such state agency as he considers appropriate and based on the outcome of such investigations commence prosecution under section 87 of the Elections Act.
- 39. <u>THAT</u> the presidential election was conducted in accordance with the Constitution and the Elections Act and all other relevant statutes and a valid declaration of the -30 outcome of the presidential election made.
- 40. THAT I swear this affidavit in opposition to the Petition filed herein.

41. <u>THAT</u> the facts deponed to herein are true to the best of my knowledge, save for facts deposed to on information and belief, sources and grounds whereof I have disclosed.

SWORN at NAIROBI

This ...26th day of ... August 2022

By the said

PROF. ABDI YAKUB GULIYE

CHRISPINE OUMAH MIGELE

AVOCATE - COMMISSIONER FOR OATHS
P. O. BOX 24193 - 00100, NAIROBI

P105 /15250 /18

V DEPONENT

BEFORE ME

**COMMISSIONER FOR OATHS** 

#### DRAWN & FILED BY:

#### 1. G&A ADVOCATES LLP

AVENUE 5 BUILDING, 4<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR ROSE AVENUE, OFF LENANA ROAD, P.O. BOX 22966-00100

#### **NAIROBI**

Email: info@gallp.co.ke

#### 2. MOHAMMED MUIGAI LLP

4<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR, K-REP CENTRE WOOD AVENUE, OFF LENANA ROAD P.O. BOX 61323-00200

#### **NAIROBI**

Email: <u>info@mohammedmuigai.com</u> <u>litigation@mohammedmuigai.com</u>

#### **NAIROBI**

EMAIL: <u>info@murugurigorolaw.co.ke</u> murugurigoroadv@yahoo.com

4. GARANE & SOMANE ADVOCATES
PITMAN HOUSE 1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR
JAKAYA KIKWETE ROAD
P O BOX 2617 - 00100
NAIROBI

info@garaneadvocates.com mahat@garaneadvocates.com

## COPIES TO BE SERVED ON

PAUL MWANGI & COMPANY ADVOCATES
VISION PLAZA
3RD FLOOR, ROOM 16
MOMBASA ROAD
P.O. BOX 55903-00200
NAIROBI
PMLAWCHAMBERS12@GMAIL.COM

-10

This is the exhibit marked affidavit of referred to in the annexed affidavit of declaration sworn before me on the

day of

COMMISSIONER FOR OATHS

To the crown and the state of t

22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2022

REF: No. IEBC/ CO/CORR/GEN/VOL. I (11)

Commissioner Prof. Abdi Guliye Mr. Marjan Hussein Marjan

RE: APPOINTMENT TO THE RESULTS MANAGEMENT TEAM AT THE PRESIDENTIAL TALLYING CENTRE – BOMAS OF KENYA

Reference is made to the above-stated subject matter.

Pursuant to Section 39 of the Elections Act and Regulations 83 and 84 (1) and 2(a) the Commission has designated Bomas of Kenya as the Presidential Election Tallying Centre for the 9<sup>th</sup> August 2022 General Election.

Consequently, You are hereby appointed to manage the Presidential Election Results Path as follows;

Commissioner Prof. Abdi Guliye

- Team Leader

Mr. Marjan Hussein Marjan

- Alternate Team Leader

The broad Terms of Reference of the Team are:

- 1. Undertaking quality Assurance of results forms received from the Presidential Returning Officer desk.
- 2. Tallying and processing of election results.
- 3. Assist the Presidential Returning in managing a record of the election results.

Copies of letters of appointment of the team are attached herein for your information, record and further necessary action.

The Appointment takes effect immediately.

W. W. CHEBUKATI

**CHAIRMAN** 

address: Anniversary Towers, 6th Floor, off University Way, P.O Box 45371-00100 Nairobi, Kenya phone: +254 (0) 2769000, fax: +254 (0) 20 2219185, email: info@lebc.or.ke, website: www.iebc.or.ke

This is the exhibit marked... referred to in the annexed affidavit OB EXTRACT. OB NO. 29/15/08/2022 AT 2000 HRB COMMISSIONER FOR OATHS LANGIATA POLICE STATION. 1 MCIDENT REPORT! Today the August 2022 at around 1700 1715 Ochagues Hall, Bomac of Kenya Andrivian diplomate as well as Azima and supporter isites of beeting itte results, whon the ente; Ledama Olekina, Saitabao and Gladge Wangs anny often Sumper stage who the TERC Chairman Chelokati was preparing to presidential oraculte. The above above agents ely toward the PERC Chairnan with Ware veder ring the Commosiu, Several red any Them; - IEBC Hucsein Warpain Abdi Makul esoly was repord. end without anotheridant

The event over two thousand bende was in		
The event over two thousand people were in alternance. The event efortal at about 1680his	-5.A <sub>2</sub>	
The event, over two thousand people wore is affected at about 1630hrs.	5	Dere i affermance of Prof. George 12 gekoge De Moraure Washigs and B Dr. William Isane
Stored Jammup		attendance. The event efortal at about 168 obre
	,	Signed James
	,	
	,	



24/8/2022 TIME 7-431-11

SEVENA HOIEL. Statement Form3

A CONTRACTOR OF THE PROPERTY O

COMMISSIONER FOR OATHS

111 NO-0218953 ABAI YAKUB GULIYE BOX-45371-ODIOD NIA180BI IEL-0123-800242

HOME PARTICULARS'

AIST- WASIR WEST

AILI- BIRIFTU

LOC- CHRIFTU

SVB-LOC-GRIFTU

ANNIUERSALY NOWER- 1EBC-10

My the about mentioned plason aged 60 years and work with Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission (IEBC) as a lominissioner. Am one of the Mingest Burning 1EBC Commissioner and with to Afatra as

that one month prior hotels was

Acte Misch hook place on 9/2/022

We used to have sound making lotte possible francis, partial posting to the Agent

IEBL Abolting in Bomas. My

Loc XX

Orl 6953

P.28



24/8/2022 TIME 1717311114

SEPENA HOTEL Ghair Statement Form 4

(1) Metrange of Election operations of Research Strategies and Lourd Devimitation lund on that Mare At Bomas I was the train Techer for the teallying centre lund I will to Brates as follow: -

I do remember may wall

that on 15/8/2022 at abound 10 4.00 pm we had a meeting in the CEO place at the Bomas With Mud Commissioners They erre, the chairman IERC was Charing the meeting Deputy Chair and Atus Officer IERC Courses Alta the Admichine from the boardroom somewited minutes after four we alless the Celly Centre From the 20 busement and elimb up to to the mording room for Commissioned Al Atua Wording NOOM, the Chevernan My Chador Kasi Ousked the presidential Atgents to long to the holding room

Roc Alle July 16953



24/8/2022 TIME 17-43+ns

SELENA HOTEL Statement Form 15

Copies of final results and also to sign by the results while week All the most thing were and they were given lopines of final results and then Azimo Agents and their Azimo Agents allost their land and their this tentum after realising that to this land acted lost the Elections.

Man Said Mat the eigents Illo were in eigreement with the result Dem contra sign the NESULE Mich is a provision At that points the Azmiongent My. SAITABAO OLE KAMEITURI Stormed out Instead of signing - 20 the final results. All the others Hgante for masidantiel Condidutes Bigned Out Atra Chairman My Chebocati led us to the Modium Ao dotter declairation of final orcsults. He we was eletuelly sitting on the chair's

loc X

July 3.3



24/8/022 TIME

TIME 7431+nu

SELEMA

Statement Form 6

Sorrounded by AZIMIO PARTY BOOME LED My their Unit Agent MY SAITARAD, in the lumping of One MY JAMES ORIENGO, OLE KINIA, OTIENAE OMOLLO comony DEENGO AND MY OTIENDE ENGUGIA the Manuan as to uliffe Was decicinny the final value-10 Quid lu Commotion ensued and they proceeded to where we were Eccited on the chair and we loud not Access the microphone Inhouse to Shigh us will being elessisted by other society Officed and on Abut commotion, I was injusted on both my legs between the know eind 20 the Anxies Wing blunt objects end we war yescued to the Holding room Muse We come Moint A Necliza Strict 1 ruas

LOC July 16953



24/8/022

174317ns

Statement Form

61 = Ding from Music 1 was Mywids The EED MY MAZJANI locus injured on his back of his head using bront object. Domnissioner Molv was invide on his IGA leg between the Kince and ankie We stayed on the hording room until the normaley was restored in the TALLYMIG RENTRE COM ON the roam.

Alta that the chairman West rescorted to the rodium Dund his made the Annousment. I was eitherard by ST SOAN Anna Cinca Mo Cramad way Legs and they locuracing the Wounds, The resulti was Emmouneed by the Chairman and a sound the earlificate to

Loc AA

my life. THAL AN I CAM STATE.

the Lenety president His Excellent 20

De William! Photo. From Atrac 1

Went into bilding for faring of



24/2/072 TIME 17/13/12/

SERFULA HOIEL-

# Statement Form 18

FURTHER STATEMENT.

AMONG THE PROPLE Who come

No SOTTONA US, 1 also saw

On Any wanga-

Poc X

Julija, 02/6953